

CLAIM SUMMARY / DETERMINATION FORM

Date	: 12/1/2010
Claim Number	: N09006-0002
Claimant	: State of Texas
Type of Claimant	: State
Type of Claim	: Removal Costs
Claim Manager	: Stephen Coode
Amount Requested	: \$17,502.28

FACTS:

- 1. *Oil Spill Incident:*** On November 22, 2008, the National Response Center (NRC) received a call from Coast Guard MSD Brownsville reporting that bad weather had caused the fishing vessel *Miss Rhianna* to run aground into jetties and discharged a large amount of fuel. The incident occurred at the jetties near the Brazos Santiago Pass, discharging diesel fuel, per the NRC Incident Report #890716.¹ The Brazos Santiago Pass, located in South Padre Island, Texas, is on the Gulf of Mexico. The Gulf of Mexico is a navigable waterway of the United States. It was determined that the vessel was in a hazardous location at the end of the jetty tip and 2,700 gallons of fuel was discharged at the site.
- 2. *Description of removal actions:*** The Coast Guard informed the Texas General Land Office (TGLO) of the incident and met to form an action plan. TGLO called in the claimant, Marine Salvage and Service, Incorporated (Marine Salvage) to begin clean up efforts. The responsible party (RP), David Aparicio, took responsibility for the incident and then hired claimant to clean up the discharge and salvage of the vessel, under the oversight of TGLO. After the clean up began, the RP declared that he did not have the money or insurance to continue the clean up efforts due to the complexity of the salvage. Due to the RP's inability to pay for the clean up and salvage, the Federal On-Scene Coordinator Representative (FOSCR), MST1 David Deases of Coast Guard Sector Corpus Christi/MSD Brownsville, federalized the incident on November 25, 2008. On November 27, 2008 T & T Marine Salvage, Incorporated (T & T Marine) began working under a Basic Ordering Agreement (BOA) to conduct the clean up and salvage activities. T&T Marine hired the claimant as a subcontractor on November 28, 2008.
- 3. *The Claim:*** On December 11, 2008, Marine Salvage submitted a bill to the owner of the F/V Rhianna, Mr. David Aparicio; when they did not receive compensation from Mr. Aparicio, Marine Salvage submitted a claim to the TGLO, which paid their determined amount of \$12,998.25. On November 9, 2010, TGLO submitted a removal cost claim to the National Pollution Fund Center (NPFC) for reimbursement of their uncompensated removal costs in the amount of \$17,502.28.

TGLO is claiming state personnel expenses of \$573.24, state equipment expenses of \$3,680.00, Marine Salvage personnel/equipment and disposal costs in the amount of \$12,998.25 which covers service dates of November 22, 2008 through November 25, 2008, and indirect expenses of \$250.79.

¹ See NRC Report #890716 dated November 22, 2008.

APPLICABLE LAW:

Under OPA 90, at 33 USC § 2702(a), responsible parties are liable for removal costs and damages resulting from the discharge of oil into navigable waters and adjoining shorelines, as described in Section 2702(b) of OPA 90. A responsible party's liability will include "removal costs incurred by any person for acts taken by the person which are consistent with the National Contingency Plan". 33 USC § 2702(b)(1)(B).

"Oil" is defined in relevant part, at 33 USC § 2701(23), to mean "oil of any kind or in any form, including petroleum, fuel oil, sludge, oil refuse, and oil mixed with wastes other than dredged spoil".

The Oil Spill Liability Trust Fund (OSLTF), which is administered by the NPFC, is available, pursuant to 33 USC §§ 2712(a)(4) and 2713 and the OSLTF claims adjudication regulations at 33 CFR Part 136, to pay claims for uncompensated removal costs that are determined to be consistent with the National Contingency Plan and uncompensated damages. Removal costs are defined as "the costs of removal that are incurred after a discharge of oil has occurred or, in any case in which there is a substantial threat of a discharge of oil, the costs to prevent, minimize, or mitigate oil pollution from an incident".

Under 33 USC §2713(b)(2) and 33 CFR 136.103(d) no claim against the OSLTF may be approved or certified for payment during the pendency of an action by the claimant in court to recover the same costs that are the subject of the claim. See also, 33 USC §2713(c) and 33 CFR 136.103(c)(2) [claimant election].

33 U.S.C. §2713(d) provides that "If a claim is presented in accordance with this section, including a claim for interim, short-term damages representing less than the full amount of damages to which the claimant ultimately may be entitled, and full and adequate compensation is unavailable, a claim for the uncompensated damages and removal costs may be presented to the Fund."

Under 33 CFR 136.105(a) and 136.105(e)(6), the claimant bears the burden of providing to the NPFC, all evidence, information, and documentation deemed necessary by the Director, NPFC, to support the claim.

Under 33 CFR 136.105(b) each claim must be in writing, for a sum certain for each category of uncompensated damages or removal costs resulting from an incident. In addition, under 33 CFR 136, the claimant bears the burden to prove the removal actions were reasonable in response to the scope of the oil spill incident, and the NPFC has the authority and responsibility to perform a reasonableness determination. Specifically, under 33 CFR 136.203, "a claimant must establish -

- (a) That the actions taken were necessary to prevent, minimize, or mitigate the effects of the incident;
- (b) That the removal costs were incurred as a result of these actions;

(c) That the actions taken were determined by the FOSC to be consistent with the National Contingency Plan or were directed by the FOSC.”

Under 33 CFR 136.205 “the amount of compensation allowable is the total of uncompensated *reasonable* removal costs of actions taken that were determined by the FOSC to be consistent with the National Contingency Plan or were directed by the FOSC. Except in exceptional circumstances, removal *activities* for which costs are being claimed must have been coordinated with the FOSC.” [Emphasis added].

DETERMINATION OF LOSS:

A. Overview:

1. The Federal On-Scene Coordination was provided by MST1 David Deases of Coast Guard Sector Corpus Christi/MSD Brownsville.
2. The incident involved a discharge of “oil” as defined in OPA 90, 33 U.S.C. § 2701(23), to navigable waters.
3. In accordance with 33 CFR § 136.105(e)(12), the claimant has certified no suit has been filed in court for the claimed uncompensated removal costs.
4. The claim was submitted within the six year statute of limitations for removal costs.
5. The NPFC Claims Manager has thoroughly reviewed all documentation submitted with the claim and determined that the removal costs presented were for actions in accordance with the NCP and that costs for these actions were indeed reasonable and allowable under OPA and 33 CFR § 136.205 as set forth below.

B. Analysis:

NPFC CA reviewed the actual cost invoices and dailies to confirm that the claimant had incurred all costs claimed. The review focused on: (1) whether the actions taken were compensable “removal actions” under OPA and the claims regulations at 33 CFR 136 (e.g., actions to prevent, minimize, mitigate the effects of the incident); (2) whether the costs were incurred as a result of these actions; (3) whether the actions taken were determined by the FOSC, to be consistent with the NCP or directed by the FOSC, and (4) whether the costs were adequately documented and reasonable.

The contractor Marine Salvage & Services, Inc. was compensated by T & T Marine from 11/28/08 – 12/5/08 and they were compensated from the NPFC for 11/26/08 – 11/27/08 leaving them uncompensated for the costs paid by TGLO from 11/22/08 – 11/25/08. The NPFC has confirmed the actions were overseen by TGLO and the rates were billed in accordance with the rate schedule in place at the time the services were rendered. On that basis, the Claims Manager hereby determines that the claimant did in fact incur \$17,502.28 of uncompensated removal costs and that that amount is payable by the OSLTF as full compensation for the reimbursable removal costs incurred by the claimant and submitted to the NPFC under claim #N09006-0002. The claimant states that all costs claimed are for uncompensated removal costs incurred by the claimant for this incident on November 22, 2008. The claimant represents that all costs paid by the claimant are compensable removal costs, payable by the OSLTF as presented by the claimant.

C. Determined Amount:

The NPFC hereby determines that the OSLTF will pay \$17,502.28 as full compensation for the reimbursable removal costs incurred by the Claimant and submitted to the NPFC under claim #N09006-002. All costs claimed are for charges paid for by the Claimant for removal actions as that term is defined in OPA and, are compensable removal costs, payable by the OSLTF as presented by the Claimant.

AMOUNT: \$17,502.28

Claim Supervisor: *Donna Hellberg*

Date of Supervisor's review: *12/10/10*

Supervisor Action: *Approved*

Supervisor's Comments:

U.S. Department of
Homeland Security

**United States
Coast Guard**



Director
United States Coast Guard
National Pollution Funds Center

NPFC CA MS 7100
US COAST GUARD
4200 Wilson Blvd. Suite 1000
Arlington, VA 20598-7100
Staff Symbol: (CA)
Phone: [REDACTED]
E-mail [REDACTED]@uscg.mil
Fax: 202-493-6937

5890
12/10/2010

VIA EMAIL: [REDACTED]@glo.state.tx.us

State of Texas
ATTN: Mrs. Peggy Spies
General Land Office
1700 N. Congress Avenue
Austin, TX 78701-1495

Re: Claim Number N09006-0002
TGLO # 2008-4194

Dear Mrs. Peggy Spies:

The National Pollution Funds Center (NPFC), in accordance with the Oil Pollution Act (OPA) (33 U.S.C. 2701 et seq.), has determined that \$17,502.28 is full compensation for OPA claim number N09006-0002.

This determination is based on an analysis of the information submitted. Please see the attached determination for further details regarding the rationale for this decision.

If you accept this determination, please sign the enclosed Acceptance/Release Form where indicated and return to the above address.

If we do not receive the signed original Acceptance/Release Form within 60 days of the date of this letter, the determination is void. If the determination is accepted, an original signature and a valid tax identification number (EIN or SSN) are required for payment. If you are a Claimant that has submitted other claims to the National Pollution Funds Center, you are required to have a valid Central Contractor Registration (CCR) record prior to payment. If you do not, you may register free of charge at www.ccr.gov. Your payment will be mailed or electronically deposited in your account within 60 days of receipt of the Release Form.

If you have any questions or would like to discuss the matter, you may contact me at the above address or by phone at 2 [REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Sincerely,

Stephen Coode
Claims Manager

ENCL: Claim Summary / Determination Form
Acceptance/Release Form

U.S. Department of
Homeland Security

**United States
Coast Guard**



Director
United States Coast Guard
National Pollution Funds Center

NPFC CA MS 7100
US COAST GUARD
4200 Wilson Blvd. Suite 1000
Arlington, VA 20598-7100
Staff Symbol: (CA)
Phone: [REDACTED]
E-mail: [REDACTED]@uscg.mil
Fax: 202-493-6937

Claim Number: N09006-0002 TGLO # 2008-4194	Claimant Name: State of Texas ATTN: Mrs. Peggy Spies General Land Office 1700 N. Congress Avenue Austin, TX 78701-1495
---	--

I, the undersigned, ACCEPT the determination of \$17,502.28 as full compensation for the Removal Costs incurred.

This determination represents full and final release and satisfaction of all Removal Costs incurred under the Oil Pollution Act of 1990 (33 U.S.C. 2712(a)(4)), associated with the above referenced claim. This determination is not an admission of liability by any party. I hereby assign, transfer, and subrogate to the United States all rights, claims, interest and rights of action, that I may have against any party, person, firm or corporation that may be liable for the loss. I authorize the United States to sue, compromise or settle in my name and the United States fully substituted for me and subrogated to all of my rights arising from the incident. I warrant that no legal action has been brought regarding this matter and no settlement has been or will be made by me or any person on my behalf with any other party for costs which are the subject of the claim against the Oil Spill Liability Trust Fund (Fund).

I, the undersigned, agree that, upon acceptance of any compensation from the Fund, I will cooperate fully with the United States in any claim and/or action by the United States against any person or party to recover the compensation. The cooperation shall include, but is not limited to, immediately reimbursing the Fund any compensation received from any other source for the same claim, providing any documentation, evidence, testimony, and other support, as may be necessary for the United States to recover from any other person or party.

I, the undersigned, certify that to the best of my knowledge and belief the information contained in this claim represents all material facts and is true. I understand that misrepresentation of facts is subject to prosecution under federal law (including, but not limited to 18 U.S.C. 287 and 1001).

_____	_____
Title of Person Signing	Date of Signature
_____	_____
Typed or Printed Name of Claimant or Name of Authorized Representative	Signature

_____	_____
Title of Witness	Date of Signature
_____	_____
Typed or Printed Name of Witness	Signature

_____	_____	_____
DUNS #	Bank Routing Number	Bank Account Number